Approach to female sex worker enrolment and dropout

HIV prevention programmes seek to address the risks and vulnerabilities of sex workers in particular, as they are at higher risk than others. Typically, Programmes have used approach of size estimation and mapping as two methods to enumerate and identify sex workers. The first approach establishes approximate numbers based on a broad methodology; a variety of methods are in practise. In the case of Mapping, it is about identifying how many currently operate in a given geography, what time and seasonal / time based variations. This helps the interventions know where to go and when to go. Both of these approaches, while useful and indeed widely used, have many inherent problems:

1. Both provide estimate or mapped estimates at any given point in time; however, in reality this constantly changes due to many reasons – migration, mobility, new people joining, sex workers leaving – temporarily or permanently. What we have is static information - however realistic.
2. A study carried out by Swasti in Bangalore indicates about 19 % new sex workers join every year and an unknown numbers drop out every year. This means about in 4-5 years, pretty much most sex workers have changed or sex worker numbers have grown significantly. Programme data usually never reflect this change.
3. To know how many have joined the trade or who have left, the Programme needs to be well connected to the key individuals and institutions which bring women into the trade and work with them. Programmes are not good at either.

In Size estimation and mapping approaches, information was collected from three types of stakeholders 'Primary Stakeholders' - Those who directly involved in the risk behaviour.. Ex FSWs, MSMs, TGs and IDUs. 'Secondary Stakeholders;' - Those who are not directly involved in the risk behaviour, they are indirectly supporting the Primary Stakeholders to continue their work. Ex. Pimps, Network Operators, Madams, Brothel Owners, Local vendors, clients, Auto drivers,......etc and 'Tertiary Stakeholders'- Those who are not directly or indirectly involved in the risk behaviour, but they will be working for them. Ex. NGOs, Doctors, Police, Lawyers..etc.

During the last decade, Secondary stakeholders played most important role, in success of the mapping approach as they had good understanding and control over the sex work trade. Individuals like, Pimps, Network Operators, Madams, Brothel Owners had good control over the sex workers, local vendors and auto drivers had good understanding about the sex workers, as majority of them used to solicit in the public places. At present, due to availability of wide range of mobile technology, majority of the Key Population (FSWs) changed their solicitation methods. They moved from solicitation in public to solicitation through mobiles. As a result sex work is becoming more hidden and inaccessible. Majority of the community members are not coming out in public places for solicitation, as a result, Secondary stakeholders doesn't have much information.
about the changes happening in the Sex Work. So, at this point of time, secondary stakeholders may not be able to contribute much to the success of the mapping approach.

**Member Enrolment / Network Mapping Approach:**

Swasti and CMS developed and tested a new approach which does not rely on one-off data collection; but make the numbers dynamic – reflecting realities. This will do away with one-off exercises and also ensure that women who need services get them – because they are accounted and counted.

This New approach followed below mentioned 7 Steps. Out of which first 5 steps are done at the field level and the last two steps are done at the office level by analysing the collected data.

1. **Step 1 : Identification of starting point persons/ Connectors**
2. **Step 2 : Establish good rapport with the starting point persons/ Connectors**
3. **Step 3 : Understand the network of the starting point persons/ Connectors**
4. **Step 4 : List out the next level starting points/ Connectors and establishing rapport**
5. **Step 5 : Progress review and data compilation.**
6. **Step 6 : Prepare the list of not contacted members.**
7. **Step 7 : Prepare the Visual Map**

Continue this process until you reach “Saturation” A point that none are able to suggest new KPs. Or, when you observe considerable decrease and stagnation in reporting of members (New & Old)

**Step 1 : Identification of starting point persons/ Connectors :**

Starting point persons or Connectors, are those individuals who are well connected with the sex work. They know more about the sex work trade and they recognize you and your work. You can identify starting points from three different categories.

1. **FSWs:** FSWs who are currently practicing sex work and are willing to involve and contribute for CO activities. You can choose those Sex Workers you know very well, you can also make selection by using MECT and Line Listing data.
2. **Senior Sex Workers:** Senior Sex Workers, who have left the sex work but are very active in soliciting clients for other sex workers.
3. **Inlet Network operators:** Individuals from community or noncommunity, who are involved in the inlet to sex work - map them, meet them and get into an non-threatening arrangement so that they are incentivised to report new entrants (How is unclear; needs to be evolved)
While selecting the starting points, keep following points in mind

- Always aim to select those who know more number of individual sex workers
- Select those who are very close to you and introduce you to other starting points such as Sex workers, Network Operators etc.
- In the beginning, avoid going to those who are not much familiar to you or who have negative opinion about you and your organization
- In the beginning, it is better to avoid selecting brothel owners or Madams as starting points. They may take it negatively and they may not give you information about other sex workers who are operating outside the brothel setup
- It is better to select more than one starting point

Step 2: Establish good rapport with the starting point persons/ Connectors

After selecting the starting point persons or Connectors, it is very important to go and meet them in person, if they have phone number, call them and fix up time for meeting. When you meet them provide following details

- Need and importance of updated data for better reach.
- Purpose the data collection
- Methodology followed in this approach - Snowballing
- Confidentiality ensured
- How the higher enrolment and dropout will benefit to the community

💡 While establishing rapport with the starting point person, keep following points in mind

- Never rush the discussion
- Don't give false assurances
- Possible services, free training on HIV and also where she can get SP, FS and other services, including UHD numbers – which will add up at least Rs 10,000 to her income overall, over a period (depending on SP uptake)
- Never increase the expectations
- Never ever, share information about those sex workers known to you.
- Before asking details about other sex workers, make sure, they have realised the importance of sharing information about other sex workers
- Follow this processes consistently with all the respondents
Step 3 : Understand the network of the starting point persons/ Connectors

After building good rapport with the starting point person/connector, Ask them to information about all the sex workers and other stakeholders (Network operators, brokers, clients, auto drivers etc.) they know and collect information using checklists

- Annex A - Checklist for collecting information from FSW
- Annex B - Checklist for collecting information from Network Operators
- Annex C - Checklist for collecting information from Clients

💡 While continuing the discussion, follow below mentioned process

- First collect the total number of members known to the respondent and then ask for individual names
  Ex - Respondent may know about 9 individuals, in this case. First ask her to give total number, in this case, it is 9. After getting this number ask them to give names of all the 9 members. This will ensure, you will not miss any member
- After listing each member name, collect details of each member using the checklist.
- Before starting new interview, complete the documentation of the first interview

Step 4 : List out the next level starting points/ Connectors and establishing rapport

After collecting all the information and completing the documentation, request the respondent to choose individuals from the given list (Starting points/Connectors) who can give more information about other sex workers. Request them to introduce you to other starting point or connectors (those individuals who can give information about other workers.) Take their permission to meet them personally.

💡 While collecting this information, following scenarios may emerge

- They may refuse to choose any other members, it is quite common, in such cases, spend more time with the respondent and help them to understand the importance of this information. If they not agree, leave it don’t pressurise them.
  Note : This is an indication that, your network process will stop at this point. Prepare separate list of such type of respondents. You can meet them later with different strategies.
- They may agree and choose some names. Once the selection is completed, encourage them to introduce you to the selected individuals by phone call, or join you when you go to meet them.
- They may call some individuals and directly introduce you to them.
  
  Note -
  - When they call some and introduce you over phone, speak to them and fix up time, venue and date of meeting. Also share your number with them.
  - Some individuals may disagree to meet in person, in such cases, check with them, whether they can provide information over phone. Fix up time of call and also the phone number.
- They may tell you to call or meet them in person and take her reference
- They may point out some and say, you can meet them or call them directly, but not take her reference.
- They may take time to introduce
  - Ex - They may suggest you to come some other day, they will introduce you to the sex workers.
- They may point out some sex workers, and suggest you, not to call or meet them. She will inform when can you go and meet them.
  
  Note : Prepare separate list of such individuals and keep in touch with follow up calls.

**Step 5 : Progress review and data compilation**

This is the most important step of the member enrolment process. This needs to be done on daily basis. At the end of each field day it is necessary to have a review of the day and compile the collected data, note down qualitative information and reconcile conflicting information.

This will help in understanding the progress made during the days data collection process and also the success rate of the member enrolment process. Which will be useful for finalizing the next day\'s field plan and take corrective actions to ensure the quality of member enrolment approach.

Note: The process of data collation is through teamwork, however the primary responsibility for data collation lies with the team leader.

There are 2 sheets to be filled depending on the level of information sought

1. Member Enrolment/ Network Mapping Sheet - For recording details provided by the starting points.
2. Data compilation Sheet - For compiling the data collected by all field workers.
💡 While entering the documentation and data compilation sheets, focus on following points

- All sheets should be filled in legibly and correctly
- All sheets should have the date, FW name and ID, Place name recorded by the FW
- Depending on the type of information sought, entries in the cell could either be:
  - A number
  - Words/Sentences (names, contact details, observations, etc.)
  - A code
Some Pointers for Member Enrollment Sheet

- It is critical to print the format in A3 size.
- The Primary responsibility of filling this sheet lies with the interviewer.
- The primary responsibility for reviewing this sheet lies with field coordinator.
- It is critical to number the member enrolment sheets used by each FW/Interviewer.
  - Ex. If the FW participate in the Network Mapping process for 10 days and uses 16 Sheets, sheets should be numbered in continuation with the previous, ie. from 1 to 16.
- Every day Field Worker may use one or two sheets.
- If space is available, in the sheet, same sheet should be used for 2 days also.
  - Ex. Above sheet has details from two days. (14th & 15th Dec 16)
- When starting interview with new starting point/connector, numbering should start from 1.
  - Ex. Above sheet, provides details about three interviews conducted by the interviewer. Numbering started from 1 for each respondent.
• When using more than one sheet, if the name of the KPs are extending to other sheet, numbering should continue from the first sheet.
  Ex. In the above table, third respondent provided details about 9 KPs. If she has given 15 KPs details, the next sheet should start with 10 and continue up to 15 and complete the interview. Next interview, start from 1.
• In column D, should be filled with starting point / connector / respondent name and column E should be filled with the name of the KP as suggested by the respondent. When you contact the KP to get details about more KPs, she will become the starting point, so her name should come in column D.
  Ex. In the above sheet, 'Lata' is 1st starting point/respondent, so her name is filled in column D. She provided 10KPs details, all the 10 KPs names are filled in column E. Out of these 10 KPs 'Dhanalakshmi' was approached for further details, so, now she became the starting point, so her name her name will come in column D.
• Each column needs to be filled properly. Spend more time and probe to get most of the information.
• The interviewer/FW should be cautious in filling the names of KPs. Respondents may give different names of the same KPs. When respondent gives new name, just ensure it is new name not the other name of the listed KPs.
• Some KPs names are given by more than one respondent, collect the details as provided by the respondent. Don't interrupt by saying, this name was given by other respondent. Just ensure they give you correct name. (NETWORK SOFTWARE will sort this duplication)
• Be cautious, while collecting, residential address (Column N). Try to get specific information.
  Ex. For example, Cantonment Road should not be filled in as Cantonment Road Area.
• In case there is information on KPs who are outside the town/district, that needs to be mentioned in remarks column.
• If the respondent is hesitant to provide some details, like address and phone number of the KP, don’t pressurise her. – what is important is to record the name of the KP and to establish good rapport with the respondents so that he/she may be contacted later for further interactions.
• After completing the day’s work, prepare a list of potential starting points. KPs who are willing to provide information about more KPs. This will help for planning next day's field visits.
  Ex. In the above format, out of 10 KPs enrolled on 14th Dec 16, 4 KPs are willing to provide further details.
  Out of 15 KPs enrolled on 15th Dec 16, 7 KPs are willing to provide further details.
2. Data Compilation - Daily Tracking Sheet

This sheet tracks the progress made during the day in terms of number of interviews conducted, number of KPs enrolled and number of KPs willing to provide next level information. The purpose of this sheet is to ascertain whether the appropriate starting points/ respondents have been covered. This will also ensure that coverage is not restricted to known contacts only, in which case the information is likely to be skewed.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SN</th>
<th>Name of the Interviewer</th>
<th>No. of Interviews conducted - Day wise</th>
<th>No. of KPs enrolled - Day wise</th>
<th>No of KPs willing to provide next level Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D1</td>
<td>D2</td>
<td>D3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Savithri</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Lakshmi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rama</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Deepa</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Padma</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Data provided in the table is not real, it is a dummy data.

DC - Direct Contacts: Are those which are identified by you directly.

NM - Network Mapping: These are the contacts / starting points generated through network mapping process.

N - New Members: Are those individual KPs, who are not aware about the CO/TI activities and have not availed any services.

O - Old Members: Are those individuals, who know about CO / TI activities and they might have taken one or the other services from CO / TI activities.
Some Pointer for daily tracking sheet

- It is essential to compile the data on day to day basis and the daily tracking sheet.
- It is useful to have weeks data in one sheet, this will help for understanding the progress made in one week.
- Above table gives example of compilation of 2 days of work done by 5 interviewers.
  - On day 1, team conducted 34 interviews, and enrolled 130 KPs (44 New and 86 Old KPs). All the 34 interviews are direct contacts
    - Normally, member enrolment / network mapping process starts with direct contacts, identified starting points, so on day one team will meet direct contacts.
  - Among the enrolled 130 KPs, 52 KPs are willing to share more information about the KPs.
  - On day 2, team conducted 48 interviews (27 Direct Contacts and 21 Identified through Network Mapping) and enrolled 174 KPs (37 New and 137 Old KPs)
  - Among the enrolled 174 KPs, 75 KPs are willing to share more information about the KPs.
- Day 2 onwards, interviewers should meet the contacts generated through Network Mapping approach. Those individuals who are willing to share the information. This will ensure, enrolment of new members into the programme.
- Once the list of next level informants (Starting points) is ready, based on the agreed points in step 4, prepare daily field visit plan and meet each one of them and repeat step 2, 3 and 4. This approach will help for building strong network at field level.
- As mentioned in step 4, different scenarios may emerge, during this stage, note down all the responses and take necessary actions.
- Daily tracking sheet will help to understand the quality of work done by each individual team member and also the team.
  Example: It will help to understand
  - Average number of interviews conducted by each FW.
  - Average number of KPs enrolled - New & Old
  - Average number of KPs willing to give next level information.
  This analysis will be very useful to understand the strengths and weakness of team members, based on which required support can be extended.
- The primary responsibility for maintaining this table lies with the field coordinator
- The primary responsibility for reviewing this table lies with the team leader
- This sheet will be useful to assess the performance of the individual FWs.
- The FWs will not be involved with the maintenance/updating of this sheet
- The data for this sheet will be collated from Member enrolment sheet submitted by the FW
• The daily tracking sheet will be updated every day, till the last day of fieldwork

3. Data Compilation - Quality Assessment

This sheet tracks the quality of the Member enrolment / Network mapping approach followed in the field. Success of the mapping approach will be measured based on the number of KPs contacted using network process. The purpose of this sheet is to determine the quality of work done by each team member.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SN</th>
<th>Name of the Interviewer</th>
<th>No of KPs willing to provide next level Information - Day wise</th>
<th>No of KPs Contacted for NM - Day wise</th>
<th>Pending Number of Contacts for NM - Day</th>
<th>Success rate of Network Approach</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D1</td>
<td>D2</td>
<td>D3</td>
<td>D4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Savithri</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Lakshmi</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rama</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Deepa</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Padma</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>13</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

💡 Some Pointer for Quality Assessment Sheet

• It is essential to analyse the data on day to day basis.
• It is useful to have weeks data in one sheet, this will help for understanding the progress made in one week.
• Above table gives example of compilation of 2 days of work done by 5 interviewers.
  o Among the 5 FWs only one individual(Rama) is following the Network mapping approach.
  o In Lakshmi’s case, 12 KPs, are potential for providing the information, she met only 7.
  o In other three FWs, performance is very poor, quick actions need to be taken.
    ▪ Reorientation.
    ▪ Hand holding support in the field
    ▪ Pairing them with one another

• Above table gives example of compilation of 2 days of work done by 5 interviewers
Step 6: Prepare the list of not contacted members

This is one of the important steps in member enrolment process. This can be done after completing the field process. This will help in reaching the saturation. Non contacted members can be categorized into following three categories.

1. List of Individual KPs who are not willing to share the information
2. List of Individual KPs who are not having Mobile phone
3. List of Individual KPs who are operating independently.

- Once this list is ready, bifurcate them into different areas and allot the list to the concerned FW of the areas and ensure that, as part of regular outreach, she continue to encourage the key connector to reach out to these individuals to convert into enrolment (or de-enrol).
- With the newly enrolled sex workers/brokers, carry out steps 2-5 again, till we reach a point that none are able to suggest any new KPs (full saturation) and continue to update a visual map.

Step 7: Prepare the Visual Network Map

This is the last step in member enrolment/network mapping process. 'Visual Map' is the pictorial representation of linkages between the KPs. Once the data collection process is completed, entered data will be imported to the Network Software. By importing the data, we will get the network map shown in the picture.

Picture : 3 Hubs

Picture : One Hub
This visual map will indicate hubs and spokes – Keep regular interaction with the hubs (key connectors), key introducers/facilitators on a monthly basis, through senior sex workers to map incoming and outgoing sex workers.

Also probe those who know no other sex workers as they are likely to be not telling the truth or maybe in the fringes of the market.

Above seven steps will ensure everyone operating in the town / operational area is mapped and enrolled into the programme.

💡 Some Pointer for using enrolment data for effective planning

- Member enrolment process will provide the list of active KPs. Compare this list with existing line listing and MECT data. Comparison of these list may result in following three situations.
  1. Present in one list only
     a. Only New List
     b. Only in MECT
     c. Only in TI Line listing
  2. Present in all the three – Continue the service
  3. Present in MECT & Line Listing only (Not in New List)

1. Present in one list only :
   - Only New List : Update the MECT using the new profile information and link it to the Outreach / Taaras app and categorise them based on new engagement strategy.
   - Only in MECT : Categorise them based on new engagement strategy and Continue the services. If you don’t reach them after repeated efforts mention as drop out (follow up – Refer TI definition )
   - Only in TI Line listing : Update the MECT using the new profile information and link it to the Outreach / Taaras app and categorise them based on new engagement strategy and Continue the services. If you don’t reach them after repeated efforts mention as drop out (follow up – Refer TI definition )

2. Present in all the three – Continue the service : Categorise them based on new engagement strategy and Continue the services.

3. Present in MECT and Line Listing (Not in New enrolment) : Categorise them based on new engagement strategy and Continue the services. If you don’t reach them after repeated efforts mention as drop out (follow up – Refer TI definition )
• Retrain the ORWs and Peers to include the approach of asking for new/exited sex workers into their day to day outreach conversations to ensure that steps 2-5 are not one off and irregular.
• Use outreach to continue to follow with connectors and others to convince the unconvinced sex workers to enrol or de-enrol – through systematic tracking.
• Critically examine how the Women would like to be contacted (Phone, person, frequency, etc) and also categorise them based on new engagement strategy.

💡 Specific actions which will help operationalise this, in one location, as a pilot

• To do this there are some imperatives:
  • Outreach network and quality has to be strong. Without regular or strong outreach ongoing capture is not feasible.
  • Duplicates and double counting are highly likely – whichever method we use as women are mobile. Therefore, there has to be methods to avoid double counting and be able to maintain a cohort.
  • Programmes need to deeply understand and be connected to various players who are involved in entry of sex workers. Without this there is likely to be a significant eclipse period (over 180 days according to one study).
  • Programmes also need to be close enough to sex workers to know when they exit or stop practicing; without stigmatising them.
  • In the above points, there is the important thing of incentives for those who enter or exit to report to the Programme.
  • Confidentiality of the information collected is critical; as the information is live.
Annex A - Checklist for collecting information from FSW

*Initiate discussion on these questions after explaining about the organization and purpose of the exercise.*

**A. Profile of Sex Worker :**

1. Can you please introduce about yourself?
2. Are you member of (share your organization Name)?
3. Since How many years you are member of (share your organization Name)?

**B. Networking/ Exposure to other community Members**

1. Do you know any other women operating as sex worker? Yes/ No.
2. If No, Ask for the reason and go to Section C.
3. If yes, Probe for following questions.
   a. How many women you know?
   b. How do they operate. ?
   c. Where do they operate?
   d. How often you meet or interact with them?
   e. Do you feel they also need above mentioned support from the organization?

If yes. Can you provide their details? (Use following table to probe for the information)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SN</th>
<th>Name of the KP</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Contact Number</th>
<th>Is she a old member or new member</th>
<th>No, of years of association with the organization</th>
<th>Place of operation</th>
<th>Current address</th>
<th>No, of years in to Sex work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**C. Networking/ Exposure to non community Members ?**

1. Do you know any other person like, Network operator, Auto driver, Pimp...etc who can give information about KPs ? Yes/ No.
2. If No, Go to Section D
3. If yes, Probe for following questions.
   a. How many members you know?
   b. How often you meet or interact with them?
   c. Can you provide their details? (Use following table to probe for the information)
D. Networking/ Exposure to clients?
   1. Do you know any clients who can give information about KPs? Yes/ No.
   2. If No, conclude the discussion.
   3. If yes, Probe for following questions.
      a. How many clients you know?
      b. How often you meet or interact with them?
      c. Can you provide their details? (Use following table to probe for the information)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SN</th>
<th>Name of the client</th>
<th>Contact Number</th>
<th>Current address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Annex B - Checklist for collecting information from Network Operators

Initiate discussion on these questions after explaining about the organization and purpose of the exercise.

Note: This checklist will be used to collect information from Network operators, pimps, clients etc.

A. Networking/ Exposure to other community Members

1. Do you know any place/ area or location, where sex workers operate?
2. Do you know any other women operating as sex worker? Yes/ No.
3. If No, conclude the discussion.
4. If yes, Probe for following questions.
   
a. How many women you know?
b. How do they operate? 
c. Where do they operate?
d. How often you meet or interact with them?
e. Do you feel they need support from the organization? Yes/ No

f. If yes. Can you provide their details? (Use following table to probe for the information)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SN</th>
<th>Name of the KP</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Contact Number</th>
<th>Place of operation</th>
<th>Current address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>